588 Change 43: Courtney Street Extension and Other Roading

■ SUBMISSIONS DEALT WITH IN THIS REPORT

Consideration Order: 5

Chapman, Ian J & Margaret J	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Maisey, Neville	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Butler, Mary & Mac, Michael	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Motueka Community Board	ZM 52	Delete indicative road connection across Open Space Zone from King Edward Street to Rural 1 Heavy Industrial Zone. Retain as access to Deferred Residential Zone (see submission point 2).
Adams, Heather	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
ASJ Property	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Atkins, Allan	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Bramwell, Ken	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Burgess, Cathrine	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Allan, Peter	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Burnett, Mike	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Butler, Jeremy	ZM 119	Confirm the indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St subject to prior upgrading of the High St/King Edward St intersection.
Butler, Jeremy	ZM 119	Specify indicative road status from King Edward St to Courtney St as narrow local suburban.
Butler, Jeremy	ZM 119	Ensure no indicative road between Hau Road and Courtney St.
Campbell, Nicholas & Catherine	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Chambers, Nicola	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Costain, John	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Costain, Sonia	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
Cumming, Jane	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
d'Ath, Vincent & Alison	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St and add a roundabout at the King Edward St/High St intersection.
Cumming, Jane	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney
	Chapman, Ian J & Margaret J Maisey, Neville Butler, Mary & Mac, Michael Motueka Community Board Adams, Heather ASJ Property Atkins, Allan Bramwell, Ken Burgess, Cathrine Allan, Peter Burnett, Mike Butler, Jeremy Campbell, Nicholas & Catherine Chambers, Nicola Costain, John Costain, John Costain, Sonia Cumming, Jane	Margaret J Maisey, Neville ZM 119 Butler, Mary & Mac, ZM 119 Motueka Community ZM 52 Adams, Heather ZM 119 Atkins, Allan ZM 119 Burgess, Cathrine ZM 119 Burgess, Cathrine ZM 119 Burnett, Mike ZM 119 Butler, Jeremy ZM 119 Butler, Jeremy ZM 119 Campbell, Nicholas & ZM 119 Campbell, Nicholas & ZM 119 Costain, John ZM 119 Costain, Sonia ZM 119 Cumming, Jane ZM 119 Cumming, Jane ZM 119

Staff Assessment Report : 588 - Change 43: Courtney Street Extension and Other Roading			
C43.3772.1	Findlay, T H and M S	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3773.1	Fox, Godfrey	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3774.1	Fox, Pete	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3775.3	Frater, Terry J & Shirley M	ZM 119	Retain indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3776.1	Freeman, J H C	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3777.1	Geer, Bob & Lorraine	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3778.1	Gordon, Brendon & Lynley	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3779.4 Support	Gregge, Sheree FC43.3779.4	ZM 119	Retain indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3780.5	Grey Power Motueka	ZM 119	Ensure indicative connecting road between Courtney St and King Edward St is funded by the subdivider rather than ratepayers.
C43.3781.1	Grooby, Terry	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3782.1	Haskell, Lauretta	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3783.1	Hemmingsen, Lisa and Wheldale, Hamish	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3784.1	Hewetson, Dot	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3785.1	Le Frantz, Irene J	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3786.1	Le Frantz, Robert J	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3788.1	Kemp, Chris	Zone Maps	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3789.1	Melse, Robert	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3790.1	Motueka South School Board of Trustees	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3791.1	Nugent, W M	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3792.1	Pope March Family Trust	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3792.2	Pope March Family Trust	C43 GEN	Solve traffic issues at King Edward/High Street intersection with a roundabout (or traffic lights) at Clock Tower Corner OR build a Bypass.

Staff Assessment Re	nort · 588 - Change	43. Courtney Stree	t Evtension and	Other Reading
Stall Assessillelli Ne	puit. Joo - Cilaliy	: 43. Coululev Suee	i Exterision and	Ouiei Roauiilu

C43.3793.1	Quested, Randall & Mary	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3794.1	Riley, Kendall & Melanie	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3796.1	Senior, Bryce	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3797.1	Senior, Matt	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3798.1	Senior, Sherry	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3799.1	Sinclair, Hilary	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3800.1	Sixtus, Robert	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3801.1	Starkey, Adrienne D	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3803.1	Thian, K & Lovell, G	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3804.1	Thorn, Robin G	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3806.1	Tooker, Mike	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3808.1	Wentworth, Mark	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.v
C43.3809.1	Widdon, Rodney	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.
C43.3810.1	Winslade-Rau, Naomi & Phil	ZM 119	Delete indicative road from King Edward St to Courtney St.

■ ASSESSMENT

1.0 INTRODUCTION

This report addresses the 51 submissions on the Courtney Street extension indicative road in the first part of the report. It also considers one submission from the Community Board (3608.5) on the indicative access road north of King Edward St in the last part of the report.

2.0 BACKGROUND

- 2.1 Plan Change 43 provides for a number of indicative roads to link the new development areas west of High Street with existing development. Initially the Motueka West structure plan did not include a linkage between King Edward Street and Courtney Street. The draft plan change map for Motueka West and Central included indicative roads between Courtney Street and Hau Road and between Courtney Street and King Edward Street.
- 2.2 The purpose of the indicative roads is to ensure linkages are formed to enhance accessibility. As explained in the Engineering report attached, Motueka tends to have a tree-like road structure with local traffic having to use the main spine road High Street for local trips. Courtney Street is a cul de sac approximately 390 metres long. The current Residential zone subdivision rules in the TRMP no longer allow the formation of long cul-de-sacs such as Courtney Street. The maximum length allowed is 80 metres (see rule 16.3.3.1 (o)(i)(b)). As well as serving 51 households, the street provides one of the two accesses to Motueka South School, a shared access to the St John ambulance station and the Jack Inglis Friendship hospital and an access to several rural properties at the western end of the street.
- 2.3 Some indicative roads that were included in the draft Motueka West plan change have been removed for example a link to Hau Road from Courtney Street has been removed as it is not intended to extend urban development in

Staff Assessment Report: 588 - Change 43: Courtney Street Extension and Other Roading

that direction. The Courtney Street linkage to King Edward Street has been retained to link future residential areas.

3.0 POLICY FRAMEWORK

- 3.1 There are several policies in the Tasman Resource Management Plan (TRMP) that are relevant to the indicative roads. The Engineering report also draws attention to some relevant policies in the Regional Land Transport Strategy (RTLS), the TDC Engineering Standards and Policies 2013 and the NZ Standard 4404 for Land Development and Subdivision Infrastructure which emphasises network connectivity for roads.
- 3.2 The relevant policies in the TRMP are:
 - "11.2.3.5 To protect future road alignments that ensure that roads can be connected where appropriate."
 - "11.1.3.4 To avoid, remedy, mitigate adverse effects of traffic on amenity values."
- 4.0 SUBMISSIONS
- 4.1 Most of the submissions are from Courtney Street residents who oppose the Courtney Street indicative road. Three submissions support it and one of these is qualified and seeks that the road is not formed until the King Edward Street/ High Street intersection is upgraded, preferably with a roundabout and that the road is formed to access road standards only. The main reasons given for opposing the indicative road are:
 - Increased traffic
 - More heavy vehicles
 - □ Conflict with hospital
 - □ Conflict with school dropoff zone

Other reasons referred to by fewer submissions:

- □ Possible devaluation effect
- Emission of light from vehicles
- Vibration from trucks
- 5.0 TRAFFIC
- 5.1 The current traffic on Courtney Street is 735 vehicles per day at the High Street end, decreasing to 100 vehicles per day at the western end where the influence of the hospital and school traffic is minimal. Courtney Street is classed as an access road on the Council's roading hierarchy and meets the standards for an access road apart from having only one footpath. The width of the road and carriageway is given in the Engineering report attached.
- 5.2 The standard for an access road requires two footpaths. Courtney Street has more than the required width for its carriageway. However the location of school and hospital accesses close together on a cul-de-sac is not ideal. The hospital has advised it is proposing to open a new main access onto High Street in the next 12-18 months (David Beatson pers comm). This will have the effect of reducing hospital traffic on Courtney Street. However the indicative link road will eventually bring some additional traffic from the Deferred Residential Zone to the north west of Motueka South School. The Motueka South School Board of Trustees (S3790) and many other submitters are concerned about industrial traffic from King Edward Street being directed through a residential neighbourhood and compromising the safety of students and residents, including elderly residents at the hospital. This route can be managed so it is not attractive to heavy traffic and residential amenity is maintained. Trucks can be kept off the route as occurs in a section of Nayland Road Nelson where there are three schools and an industrial area nearby.
- 5.3 Some submitters have pointed out the Motueka South School could benefit from the indicative road in that it would allow children from the King Edward Street area to walk safely to school without having to mix with traffic on SH 60 High Street and the busy King Edward Street/High Street intersection. The indicative road gives an opportunity to develop a rear access to the school along its western boundary which could enable more efficient walking access for some children. Currently there is a designated bus parking space on the northern side of Courtney Street adjoining the entrance to the school car park. When Courtney Street has a connection through to King Edward Street, the school bus will have other options than making turning manoeuvres at the western end of Courtney Street.
- 5.4 Some submitters have referred to the IHC group home located in Courtney Street. The IHC have group homes located on a variety of road types in the district. Courtney Street is not expected to decrease in safety as a result of the indicative road.
- 6.0 FORMATION OF THE COURTNEY ST INDICATIVE ROAD
- 6.1 Submitter 3757 who owns 1.7 hectares of undeveloped residential land at 38 Courtney Street (the western end) is concerned that the combination of the indicative road and the 25 metre setback from the Rural 1 Zone boundary will make his property unviable for future residential subdivision. The position of the indicative road on the property is not immutable. The road could be positioned to form part of the setback from the Rural 1 Zone boundary as has occurred elsewhere in the district and still allow subdivision to occur.
- 6.2 Submitter 3780.5 seeks assurance that the connecting road between Courtney Street and King Edward Street is

Staff Assessment Report: 588 - Change 43: Courtney Street Extension and Other Roading

funded by the subdivider rather than ratepayers. It is normal practice in New Zealand for the subdivider to fund and form the roading within a subdivision. The road is subsequently vested in the Council when the subdivision is completed.

7.0 VALUATION EFFECTS

Some submitters express concern that the indicative road will result in a devaluation of their properties if industrial traffic uses Courtney Street. It is agreed with the submitters that it is inappropriate for industrial traffic to use this route. When the road is built, measures will be put in place to ensure it is designed and managed as a residential access road with deterrents to general industrial traffic. Some hospital traffic is expected to be diverted onto a new access onto High Street in due course.

A valuer has been asked to comment on the devaluation concern. He states "There is little evidence to support the concern, if only residential traffic is allowed. If we look at rating land values of cul-de-sacs versus 'T' roads, there is no apparent difference in relative land values, eg, at the new Eginton Street link to Te Maatu Drive, the values of Eginton Street have not responded in either direction. Certainly very busy and heavy traffic roads have lower land values, such as High Street. If we look at Sanderlane Drive, off Monahan Street, values have increased since the through road was linked to Woodland Avenue" (Don Knight Quotable Value pers comm).

He also noted that "ordinarily, greenfield (new) subdivisions attract higher land values than exist in the mature areas adjoining, and there can even be some small cross-fertilisation of increased values in the mature situations due to improved roading and access as an influence from the new subdivision".

8.0 OTHER INDICATIVE ROAD - NORTH OF KING EDWARD ST

Motueka Community Board (S3608.5) has asked for the connection of the indicative road about 200 metres east of the College Street/King Edward Street intersection through the Open Space Zone to the Industrial Zone to be deleted. Although not stated, the Board's concern is likely to be that heavy and other industrial traffic could use the route. Whether the road is required or not depends on the long term zoning of the land between the dwellings along the north side of King Edward Street and the Open Space Zone/ greenway (see Engineering Services Department comments).

9.0 The indicative roads provide for future development at Motueka West to occur in a sustainable way with linkages to the existing road network and community facilities. Having better connected roads aligns with Council's transport and planning policies. There are techniques available to ensure unrelated industrial traffic does not use the route.

■ RECOMMENDATIONS AND REASONS

Recommendation 588.1				
C43.2683.1	Chapman, lan J & Margaret J	Disallow		
C43.3076.1	Maisey, Neville	Disallow		
C43.3346.1	Butler, Mary & Mac, Michael	Disallow		
C43.3756.1	Adams, Heather	Disallow		
C43.3757.1	ASJ Property	Disallow		
C43.3758.1	Atkins, Allan	Disallow		
C43.3759.1	Bramwell, Ken	Disallow		
C43.3760.1	Burgess, Cathrine	Disallow		
C43.3761.1	Allan, Peter	Disallow		
C43.3762.1	Burnett, Mike	Disallow		
C43.3763.1	Butler, Jeremy	Allow In Part		
C43.3763.2	Butler, Jeremy	Allow		
C43.3763.3	Butler, Jeremy	Allow		
C43.3764.1	Campbell, Nicholas & Catherine	Disallow		
C43.3765.1	Chambers, Nicola	Disallow		
C43.3767.1	Costain, John	Disallow		
C43.3768.1	Costain, Sonia	Disallow		

	Staff Assessment Report : 588 - Change 43: Courtney Stre	eet Extension and Other Roading
C43.3769.1	Cumming, Jane	Disallow
C43.3770.1	d'Ath, Vincent & Alison	Allow In Part
C43.3772.1	Findlay, T H and M S	Disallow
C43.3773.1	Fox, Godfrey	Disallow
C43.3774.1	Fox, Pete	Disallow
C43.3775.3	Frater, Terry J & Shirley M	Allow
C43.3776.1	Freeman, J H C	Disallow
C43.3777.1	Geer, Bob & Lorraine	Disallow
C43.3778.1	Gordon, Brendon & Lynley	Disallow
C43.3779.4 Allow	Gregge, Sheree FC43.3779.4	Allow
C43.3780.5	Grey Power Motueka	Allow
C43.3781.1	Grooby, Terry	Disallow
C43.3782.1	Haskell, Lauretta	Disallow
C43.3783.1	Hemmingsen, Lisa and Wheldale, Hamish	Disallow
C43.3784.1	Hewetson, Dot	Disallow
C43.3785.1	Le Frantz _, Irene J	Disallow
C43.3786.1	Le Frantz, Robert J	Disallow
C43.3788.1	Kemp, Chris	Disallow
C43.3789.1	Melse, Robert	Disallow
C43.3790.1	Motueka South School Board of Trustees	Disallow
C43.3791.1	Nugent, W M	Disallow
C43.3792.1	Pope March Family Trust	Disallow
C43.3792.2	Pope March Family Trust	Allow In Part
C43.3793.1	Quested, Randall & Mary	Disallow
C43.3794.1	Riley, Kendall & Melanie	Disallow
C43.3796.1	Senior, Bryce	Disallow
C43.3797.1	Senior, Matt	Disallow
C43.3798.1	Senior, Sherry	Disallow
C43.3799.1	Sinclair, Hilary	Disallow
C43.3800.1	Sixtus, Robert	Disallow
C43.3801.1	Starkey, Adrienne D	Disallow
C43.3803.1	Thian, K & Lovell, G	Disallow
C43.3804.1	Thorn, Robin G	Disallow
C43.3806.1	Tooker, Mike	Disallow
C43.3808.1	Wentworth, Mark	Disallow
C43.3809.1	Widdon, Rodney	Disallow
C43.3810.1	Winslade-Rau, Naomi & Phil	Disallow

Staff Assessment Report: 588 - Change 43: Courtney Street Extension and Other Roading

Plan Amendments

Topic: ZM 119

Retain the indicative road from King Edward Street to Courtney Street.

Reasons

- 1. The indicative road, links existing roads to form a network and accords with the Council's policy to have connecting roads in the Tasman Resource Management Plan, in the Regional Land Transport Strategy Connecting Tasman and the NZ Standard 4404 for Land Development and Subdivision.
- 2. The indicative road from Courtney Street to King Edward Street will enable neighbourhood traffic to use other than an arterial road for local trips.
- 2. The future road link can be designed and managed to suit its residential setting and so it is not attractive for industrial traffic.
- 3. The indicative road could enable school children from the King Edward Street area to access Motueka South School by walking/cycling on a safer and more convenient route than along State Highway 60 High Street.
- 4. It is standard practice for developers to construct subdivisional roads. There is some flexibility for the developer on the location of an indicative road, such as on S3757.1's land. These roads are later vested in and maintained by the Council.
- 5. While the Council is supportive of roading improvements at the King Edward Street / High Street intersection it is not the road controlling authority.

Recommendation 588.2

C43.3608.5 Motueka Community Board

Allow In Part

Plan Amendments

Topic: ZM 52

Retain indicative road north of King Edward Street through the Open Space Zone only if industrial zoning is retained to north east corner of King Edward /Queen Victoria Street.

Reasons

- 1. The indicative road through the Open Space Zone is necessary to maintain a road linkage in an otherwise very large block if industrial zoning is retained to the south of the Open Space Zone greenway.
- 2. The Council has reconsidered whether industrial zoning is the most appropriate zoning on the north east corner of King Edward Street / Queen Victoria Street.